

# DRAFT

Note: These Minutes will remain DRAFT until approved at the next meeting of the Committee

## WESTERN AREA PLANNING COMMITTEE

### MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON WEDNESDAY, 19 SEPTEMBER 2018

**Councillors Present:** Jeff Beck, Paul Bryant (Vice-Chairman), Hilary Cole, James Cole, Adrian Edwards, Clive Hooker (Chairman), Anthony Pick and Virginia von Celsing

**Also Present:** Derek Carnegie (Team Leader - Development Control) and Jo Reeves (Principal Policy Officer)

**Apologies for inability to attend the meeting:** Councillor Dennis Benneyworth, Councillor Billy Drummond and Councillor Garth Simpson

**Councillor Absent:** Councillor Paul Hewer

#### PART I

#### 18. Minutes

The Minutes of the meeting held on 29 August 2018 were approved as a true and correct record and signed by the Chairman.

#### 19. Declarations of Interest

There were no declarations of interest received.

#### 20. Schedule of Planning Applications

##### (1) Application No. and Parish: 18/01914/HOUSE - Cherry Hinton, Newbury Hill, Hampstead Norreys

1. The Committee considered a report (Agenda Item 4(1)) concerning Planning Application 18/01914/HOUSE in respect of a proposed two storey side extension at Cherry Hinton, Newbury Hill, Hampstead Norreys.
2. In accordance with the Council's Constitution, Mr David Barlow, Parish Council representative and Mr Andy Wilcock and Ms Theresa Fleetwood, objectors, addressed the Committee on this application.
3. Derek Carnegie introduced the report to Members, which took account of all the relevant policy and other material considerations. In conclusion the reports detailed that the proposals were acceptable and conditional approval was justifiable. Officers clearly recommended the Committee grant planning permission.
4. Councillor Barlow in addressing the Committee raised the following points:
  - The proposed development was inappropriate as it would be in close proximity to adjacent properties.
  - The drawings presented to the Committee were misleading and did not display the position of the garage to 1 Church Street correctly. The Committee would therefore not be able to understand the shadowing caused by the extension correctly.

## WESTERN AREA PLANNING COMMITTEE - 19 SEPTEMBER 2018 - MINUTES

- A single storey extension was in the process of being constructed under permitted development rights to the rear of Cherry Hinton and therefore the plans misrepresented the total development to be undertaken on the site.
  - The residents of 1 Church Street were unhappy that their courtyard garden would be overshadowed by a high towering wall.
  - Policy CS14 stated that developments should make a positive contribution to the area, which the extension would not.
5. Councillor Anthony Pick asked what the typical separation between houses in Hamstead Norreys was. Councillor Barlow advised that it varied.
6. Ms Fleetwood in addressing the Committee raised the following points:
- She had occupied 1 Church Street, which bordered Cherry Hinton to the rear, for 12 years.
  - After the previous owner passed away, it was anticipated that improvements to the property would be made however Ms Fleetwood reported she remained in shock regarding the impact and scale of the proposals.
  - The impact of the development was understated as the plans did not show the extension currently being built to the rear.
  - The case officer wrote to the applicant in May 2018 to express concerns regarding the dominance of the proposed extension and the loss of gap between properties. The revised plans did not address the case officer's concerns and overall size reduction had been less than 10%.
  - The House Extensions Supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG) (2004) set out that light and overshadowing was a key consideration regarding the impact on neighbours. There would be a significant impact on light loss and Ms Fleetwood advised her kitchen would never receive sunlight again.
  - Cherry Hinton was on higher ground than 1 Church Street which exacerbated the impact of the height of the proposed extension.
  - The extension would deny other properties the view of the church spire.
7. Councillor Adrian Edwards asked whether the applicant had discussed the revised plans with Ms Fleetwood, who confirmed he had. Councillor Edwards asked how the gap between properties would be reduced. Ms Fleetwood advised that a path to 1 Church Street ran alongside Cherry Hinton and the extension would be closer to the path than the current building.
8. In response to discussions regarding the plans, Mr Wilcock advised that the block plan being projected was incorrect and the total height of the extension from 1 Church Street, including the different ground height, would be 28ft.
9. Councillor Hilary Cole asked whether the House Extensions SPG (2004) had not been superseded by the Development Plan Document (DPD) in 2016. Mr Wilcock advised it was the most recent document on the Council's website.
10. Councillor Hilary Cole further asked whether Flint House had already been built when Ms Fleetwood moved into 1 Church Street. Ms Fleetwood confirmed it had.
11. Councillor Bryant observed that 1 Church Street should still get midday sun but would not receive sunlight in the late afternoon.

**WESTERN AREA PLANNING COMMITTEE - 19 SEPTEMBER 2018 - MINUTES**

- 12. Councillor Virginia von Celsing in addressing the Committee as Ward Member raised the following points:
  - The Parish Council had unanimously voted to object to the proposed development.
  - She was concerned regarding the potential inaccuracy of the block plan.
  - The proposed development would be too high density.
- 13. Councillor James Cole requested clarification regarding the potential inaccuracy of the plans. Derek Carnegie advised that the applicant had submitted plans based on Ordnance Survey data and officers were satisfied that the implications of the application were acceptable.
- 14. In response to a question from Councillor Bryant, Derek Carnegie confirmed that planning was a subjective discipline and officers were content with the drawings provided by the applicant.
- 15. Councillor Bryant noted that the National Planning Policy Framework required developments to contribute to the street scene and asked whether that applied from the back of the dwellings. Derek Carnegie advised that it could be argued that the extension would contribute to the family's enjoyment of their home.
- 16. Councillor Hilary Cole asked whether the 2004 guidance on extensions was a saved policy; Derek Carnegie responded that it was still relevant to determination of the application.
- 17. Councillor Pick asked what the distance would be between the extension and the garage belonging to 1 Church Street. Derek Carnegie estimated that it would be 1.5m and the distance between the ridge lines would be around 2m. Councillor Pick asked whether a precedent would be set if the Committee were to approve the application; Derek Carnegie responded that any other application would be considered on its own merits so a precedent was unlikely.
- 18. After a discussion regarding which was the correct block plan, Councillor Hilary Cole suggested deferring the application until the issue could be resolved.
- 19. Councillor Beck reported that at the site visit Members had requested sight of the memo sent by the case officer to the applicant regarding the original application and reiterated that he thought this should be provided to the Committee. Derek Carnegie advised that it was common practice for the case officer to correspond with the applicant to set out any concerns and that the case officer had been satisfied their concerns were addressed in the amended plans.
- 20. Councillor Hilary Cole proposed that the Committee defer determination of the application until the block plans could be clarified. She highlighted that the Council could be subject to challenge if the Committee made a decision on information they were not sure of. The proposal was seconded by Councillor von Celsing. The Chairman put the proposal to Committee and at the vote was carried.

**RESOLVED that** determination be deferred.

*(The meeting commenced at 6.30 pm and closed at 7.30 pm)*

**CHAIRMAN** .....

**WESTERN AREA PLANNING COMMITTEE - 19 SEPTEMBER 2018 - MINUTES**

**Date of Signature** .....